Security versus freedom: Which is more important?

Grades 11-12

To explore this complex question, you’ll choose a specific interpretive lens to examine something that is happening in your world. You will explore a variety of fiction and/or nonfiction texts to create an end product that presents your research and conclusions.

The end product will be your choice of a podcast, written opinion piece, presentation, essay, video, or other medium. Be sure to consider your audience, and how best to convey the information to them. Consider presenting some or all of the information in a language you are learning (e.g., French or English as an additional language).
1. Choose at least one issue from the first column below and at least one interpretive lens from the second column.

For example, you might choose to follow certain economic regulations though a period of history, exploring how they have protected and/or limited people of various backgrounds.

As another example, you might examine how technological surveillance is taken to an extreme in a literary work such as 1984, by George Orwell.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Interpretive lenses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How have different countries responded to the COVID-19 pandemic?</td>
<td>Literary: What stories, poems, novels, movies, and/or tv shows have you experienced that deal with the concept of security versus freedom?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do technological surveillance systems (security cameras on public streets, face recognition software, cell phone monitoring programs) impact our security and freedom – now and into the future?</td>
<td>Political: How do different countries view the security and freedom of their citizens?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What rules are in place that influence financial security and economic freedom? Consider the personal, business, regional, and global levels.</td>
<td>Historical: How has the desire for freedom and/or security shaped events in the past? How have events shaped security and freedom in society?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choose your own real-world issue or event.</td>
<td>Personal (Newcomers and English Language Learners): What security and freedom issues have you, your family, and your friends observed in Canada, your home country or a third country? Relate your experience and ask family members for their opinions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Formulate questions to guide your research.

Here are some examples:

- What does “security” mean in society? What does “freedom” mean?
- Do technologies, policies, or measures make us safer? How?
- What freedoms are we exchanging for safety? What security are we exchanging for freedom?
- How might certain measures be used (or abused) in the future to impact our safety and freedom?
- Is it possible to find the right balance between security and freedom in society? If not, which is most important? Why?
- What other questions can help you evaluate security vs. freedom?

3. Consult several sources of information and opinion.

**Read/view/listen to a variety of texts.**

- Non-fiction texts (newspaper articles, online articles, documentaries, news broadcasts, etc.)
- Fiction texts (novels, short stories, poems, TV series, movies, etc.)
- Social media (especially as a source of opinion)

Before you view each text, consider your purpose: What does this text say about security and freedom? What does the author want me to know about security and/or freedom? As you engage with the text, fill out the graphic organizers provided at the end of the document to help you think more deeply about your reading/viewing.
Fiction texts could include:

Check out texts you have at home, or browse the online NB Libraries collection. You might also find some full texts with a Google search.

- *The Bet*, by Anton Chekov (short story)
- *Brave New World*, by Aldous Huxley (novel)
- *1984*, by George Orwell (novel)
- *Blindness*, by Jose Saramago (novel)
- *I Am Real*, by Kurt Vonnegut (letter)
- *Burning a Book*, by William Stafford (poem)
- *Station Eleven*, by Emily St. John Mendel (novel)
- *Hunger Games*, by Suzanne Collins (book and movie series)
- *I, Robot* (movie)
- *Rogue One: A Star Wars Story* (movie)

For striving readers:

- *The Giver*, by Lois Lowry (novel)
- *Scythe*, by Neal Shusterman (novel)
- *Unwind*, by Neal Shusterman (novel)
- *The Lorax*, by Dr. Seuss (book and movie)

Nonfiction texts might include:

- *Do we have to give up some personal freedoms to beat coronavirus?* (Singularityhub)
- *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* – focus on articles 6, 7, and 8
- *COVID-19: How much privacy are you willing to give up?* (UXCollective)
- *Respect rights in COVID 19 response* (Human Rights Watch)
- *The October Crisis of 1970* (CBC). In this video clip of PM Pierre Elliott Trudeau, note his arguments in favour of collective security, as well as those made by the reporter in favour of individual freedoms.
- *UN Declaration of Human Rights*
- *UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* – focus on articles 7 and 46(2)
- *Un virus alarmant fait son chemin dans le monde* – p. 4 « Le Monde en Marche » Dans ce cas, est-ce qu’on devrait prioriser la sécurité des canadiens même si ça diminue notre liberté?

Survey or interview your family members and friends about their understanding of security and freedom.

What is important to them? Consider the elements of effective interview questions:

- They are open-ended.
- They don’t lead the interviewee toward one side or the other.
- They gather some background information about the interviewee.

What can you conclude from your investigation?

Explore some exemplars (effective examples) of the presentation method you have chosen.

For example, what makes a compelling podcast? How do opinion writers engage their audience? What techniques make an audience want to listen to a presenter? Be sure to incorporate those qualities into your product.

4. Present your end product.

Using all the research you have gathered, create a piece to share your findings. Your end product should present the information in a compelling manner. It may include actual interviews with your friends and family as well as other elements. Think about the list you created while you examined exemplar products. Share with family and friends to get a discussion going!
**Organizer: Nonfiction Texts**

When reading/viewing/listening to a nonfiction text, consider these four questions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What does it say? (Content of the piece)</th>
<th>What does it not say? (Information or points of view that are left out)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How does it say it? (Craft of the creator; writing techniques)</th>
<th>Who benefits from what it says? (Dominant point of view)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Organizer: Fictional Texts**

When reading/viewing/listening to any text, consider the following questions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content (What’s this text about? What does the author want me to know? What details seem essential?)</th>
<th>Head (What did I notice? What ideas did this give me? What changed, challenged, or confirmed my thinking?)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heart (How did it make me feel? What life lessons did I learn? What did I learn about others?)</th>
<th>Questions (What am I still wondering? What do I need to learn more about?)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>